Research on Reverse Transfer in CWID States

Debra Bragg
Jason Taylor
Matt Giani

CWID Convening
June 8, 2015

Credit When It’s Due

Office of Community College Research and Leadership

COLLEGE OF EDUCATION AT ILLINOIS
Today’s Talk

- Background
- Big Picture
- Research Results
- Lessons on Optimization
- Q&A
Credit When It’s Due (CWID)

Community college and university partnerships dedicated to awarding associate degrees to transfer students who complete their associate degree requirements while pursuing a bachelor’s degree.
Why CWID?

- Most transfer students do not obtain an associate’s degree before transfer.
- About 40% of transfer students do not complete a bachelor’s degree 4 years after transfer.
  - Similar result for reverse transfer-eligible students (OCCRL Baseline Study).
- Bachelor’s attainment more likely for those who obtain an associate’s degree before transfer.
  - Same result - Transfer Associate degree more predictive than Applied Associate degree (OCCRL CWID Data Note).

CREDIT when it’s due
16 CWID States
495 CWID institutions
2940 degrees by 2014
7367 degrees by 2015
12 States – legislation
12 non-CWID States exploring or planning
9 non-CWID States piloting or implementing
Reverse Transfer Policies & Processes

- Student Identification
- Consent
- Transcript Exchange
- Degree Audit
- Degree Conferral and Advising
What Do We Know about the Impact of Reverse Transfer?
CWID Research Questions

• Who participants in reverse transfer?
• Where do students get lost, and why does this happen?
• How does reverse transfer relate to retention?
• What is the effect of reverse transfer on state-level degree attainment?
Who is Eligible, Who Participates, and Who Receives Reverse Transfer Associate’s Degrees?
Meet Minimum RT Eligibility Requirements

Consent to Participate in RT (Consent Rate)

Received RT Associate Degree (of Eligible)

State A
- 100%
- 28%
- 4%

State B
- 100%
- 16%
- 9%

State C
- 100%
- 10%
- 3%
Meet Minimum RT Eligibility Requirements

Consent to Participate in RT (Consent Rate)

Received RT Associate Degree (of Eligible)

State A
- 100%
- 28%
- 4%

State B
- 100%
- 16%
- 9%

State C
- 100%
- 10%
- 3%
RT Associate’s Degree Conferral Varies by Student Background

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amer Ind/Alas Nat</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afr. Amer</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nat Haw/Pac Isl</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race Unreported</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data from MnSCU (n=8,076)
Students of Color are Less Likely to Receive RT Associate’s Degrees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Average Marginal Effects on RT Assoc Attainment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>-1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amer. Ind/ Alas. Nat.</td>
<td>-4.8%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>-0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afr. Amer Nat. Haw./ Pac. Isl.</td>
<td>-2.1%**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-racial</td>
<td>-2.4%*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>-0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-resident alien</td>
<td>-6.2%***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MnSCU data, controlling for academic and other demographic factors (n=8,076)
Where Do Students Get Lost and Why Does This Happen?
More Students Participate Under Opt-out Policy

- Total (n=1,422)
  - Yes: 76%
  - No: 22%
  - No Response: 2%

- Opt-In
  - Yes: 58%
  - No: 39%
  - No Response: 2%

- Opt-Out
  - Yes: 1%
  - No: 99%

Consent data from MnSCU (n=1,422)
Multiple Contacts Increase Student Consent Rate Under Opt-in Policy

Consent data from North Carolina (n=~8,000)
Many Students Have the Right Number but Not the Right Type of Credits

% of degree audits resulting in RT associate’s degrees by Michigan community colleges
Majority of Students Are Missing Degree Requirements

- Missing Deg Requirements (n=620)
- Graduated/ing (n=162)
- Currently Enrolled (n=103)
- Financial Hold (n=62)
- Low GPA (n=27)
- Other (n=102)

Institutional degree audit for students who did not receive RT associate’s degree in Minnesota (MnSCU) (n=1,076)
Course Substitutions, Waivers, or Competency-based Approaches Growing in CWID States

- 40% Course-to-course articulation
- 40% Competency-based articulation
- 20% Mix of course-to-course and competency-based articulation

Data from RT associate’s degrees conferred in University of Hawaii system (n=1,454)
How Does Reverse Transfer Relate to Student Retention?
Retention Analysis Using Hawaii Data

Received RT Degree in Fall 2013
- No AA or higher prior to transfer
- Met 12 credit residency requirement at UH CC
- Earned 60 cumulative credits
- 2.0 or higher CC GPA

n=410

RT Eligible, did NOT Receive RT Degree in Fall 2013
- No AA or higher prior to transfer
- Met 12 credit residency requirement
- Earned 60 cumulative credits
- 2.0 or higher CC GPA

n=1,617

Earned AA or Higher before Fall 2013
- Ineligible because earned AA or higher before fall 2013

n=2,311

Ineligible for RT
- Did not meet 12 credit res. Req. at UH CC, OR
- Did not earn 60 cumulative college credits, OR
- CC GPA less than 2.0

n=5,941
No Evidence Reverse Transfer Associate’s Degree Reduces Student Retention

Fall 2013 to Spring 2014 retention rates of University of Hawaii transfer student cohort; Retention rates include students who earned bachelor’s degrees (n=7,081)
No Evidence Receiving Reverse Transfer Associate’s Degree Leads Students to Drop Out

Average marginal effect on Fall 2013 to Spring 2014 retention, controlling for demographic and academic factors (reference group is RT ineligible students)
How Do Reverse Transfer Policies Influence State-Level Degree Attainment?
Number of Associate’s Degrees Conferred as of May June, 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>AR</th>
<th>CO</th>
<th>FL</th>
<th>HI</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>MI</th>
<th>MN</th>
<th>MO</th>
<th>NC</th>
<th>NY</th>
<th>OH</th>
<th>OR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RT Degrees Awarded (~2013-14 &amp; 2014-15)</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>1458</td>
<td>820</td>
<td>607</td>
<td>1362</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>665</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1002</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CWID Contributed ~2% Increase to State Annual Associate’s Degree Attainment

*Estimate based on associate’s degree attainment numbers from IPEDS in years 2011-12 and 2012-13
Implementation and Policy Study

Study of optimization of policies and processes using qualitative and quantitative data from the initial 12 CWID states.
Reverse Transfer Policies & Processes

- Student Identification
- Consent
- Transcript Exchange
- Degree Audit
- Degree Conferral and Advising

CREDIT when it’s due
Five Dimensions

- **Student Identification**
  - Partner Institutions
  - Eligibility Criteria
  - Frequency and Scope

- **Consent**
  - Consent Methods
  - Consent Method Outcomes

- **Transcript Exchange**
  - Transcript Exchange Method
  - Transcript Exchange Capacity

- **Degree Audit**
  - Technology Infrastructure
  - Course Equivalency Systems

- **Degree Conferral and Advising**
  - Notification
  - Engaging and Advising Near-Completers
• Arkansas
• Colorado
• Georgia
• Maryland
• Michigan
• Oregon
Eligibility

Credit right now or... Credit when ready?
Five Dimensions

- Student Identification
  - Partner Institutions
  - Eligibility Criteria
  - Frequency and Scope
- Consent
  - Consent Methods
  - Consent Method Outcomes
- Transcript Exchange
  - Transcript Exchange Method
  - Transcript Exchange Capacity
- Degree Audit
  - Technology Infrastructure
  - Course Equivalency Systems
- Degree Conferral and Advising
  - Notification
  - Engaging and Advising Near-Completers
Opt-In Consent

Get Consent Early
Change the System

CREDIT when it’s due
North Carolina Consent Experiment

Consent

Messaging

Methods

Consent
Five Dimensions

- **Student Identification**
  - Partner Institutions
  - Eligibility Criteria
  - Frequency and Scope

- **Consent**
  - Consent Methods
  - Consent Method Outcomes

- **Transcript Exchange**
  - Transcript Exchange Method
  - Transcript Exchange Capacity

- **Degree Audit**
  - Technology Infrastructure
  - Course Equivalency Systems

- **Degree Conferral and Advising**
  - Notification
  - Engaging and Advising Near-Completers
Transcript Exchange

- Fully electronic CWID states (AR, FL, HI, & OH)
- NSC Solution (MI, MO, TX and growing interest)
  - NSC PDF transcript exchange
  - NSC electronic solution
- Parchment (CO & GA)
- Academy One (TN)
Five Dimensions

Student Identification
- Partner Institutions
- Eligibility Criteria
- Frequency and Scope

Consent
- Consent Methods
- Consent Method Outcomes

Transcript Exchange
- Transcript Exchange Method
- Transcript Exchange Capacity

Degree Audit
- Technology Infrastructure
- Course Equivalency Systems

Degree Conferral and Advising
- Notification
- Engaging and Advising Near-Completers
Degree Audit

- Decentralized
- Centralized
- Cloud

Technological Frameworks for Implementing Reverse Transfer

Legend:
- Q = Identification
- Transport
- X = Transfer Credit Eval Processing
- ✔ = Degree Audit Processing

Reverse Transfer = Automation of Q + Transport + X + ✔
Degree Audit

- University of Hawaii (UH) STAR System
  - Cloud-based system interfaces with student information system
  - UH coding routine automatically audits transfer students’ transcripts against associate’s degree requirements
  - Student portal with “what if” scenarios
- Ellucian’s DegreeWorks (SUNY)
- CollegeSource Inc’s u.achieve/DARS (MnSCU)
Five Dimensions

- **Student Identification**
  - Partner Institutions
  - Eligibility Criteria
  - Frequency and Scope

- **Consent**
  - Consent Methods
  - Consent Method Outcomes

- **Transcript Exchange**
  - Transcript Exchange Method
  - Transcript Exchange Capacity

- **Degree Audit**
  - Technology Infrastructure
  - Course Equivalency Systems

- **Degree Conferral and Advising**
  - Notification
  - Engaging and Advising Near-Completers
MI, OH, & AR:

- Communicate missing degree requirements
- Provide missing degree requirements to university advisors
- Empower students to audit degrees (technology)
STUDENT VOICES
Student Voices on Reverse Transfer

OCCRL: What was your reaction when you got the email [about your reverse transfer associate degree]?

Student 1: Stoked. I was stoked… We need the credentials and the degrees and stuff to keep our contracts with different agencies in the community, so that we can keep our place running. So, I was super stoked!

Student 2: I’m so close to getting a BA anyway, or BS. So, it was kind of like it didn’t really matter, I guess. But it could matter for some people, definitely.

Student 3: We’re still working on our degree, but it shows we’ve accomplished something. It’s a great feeling to have accomplished something.
Student Voices on the RT Degree

OCCRL: What about the reverse transfer degree?

Student 1: That’s pretty sweet. I’ll take it. (ADN)

Student 2: I’ll take credit for credentials and certifications. (General Degree)

Student 3: It’s a fru fru degree, like just to say I have a degree. I wouldn’t want to do that. (General Degree)

Student 4: It doesn’t say anything to an employer… It’s just okay, you took some general courses… It doesn’t really say anything about you. (General Degree)
OCCRL: Thinking about your experience, are there any disadvantages to receiving the associate’s degree right now or before you get your bachelor’s degree?

Student: I lost a scholarship… I forget what the title of the scholarship was, but one of the requirements is that you could not have a degree and you are seeking a degree. So, when I received it [RT], I became ineligible. It was like $700 or so, but still it’s $700.
OCCRL: What is your experience with reverse transfer?

Student: I went to work when I graduated high school, so I went to college planning to get a bachelor’s degree… I looked at my options in terms of credits and what you can do. There was no point to my getting an associate’s degree in many ways. Why not get the credits to get access to a 4-year institution and move on and pursue that degree. But in some ways, it’s a shame that is how it is set up… I developed very good relationships with my professors, so it would have been nice to get the associate’s, but I wasn’t convinced that it was going to be worth it.
CWID is…
CWID is…

- Enhancing state and institutional policies
- Investing in new technologies to support transfer
- Reducing barriers to degree completion
- Impacting larger transfer population
- Leading a national conversation on the value of the associate’s degree
- Still evolving
Continuing Research

- State implementation study
- Student focus groups
- Single-state analyses
- Cross-state analyses
- Mixed method analyses
OCCRL Contacts:

- Debra Bragg – dbragg@illinois.edu
- Jason Taylor – jason.taylor@utah.edu
- Matt Giani – mgiani@illinois.edu

CWID Website: http://occrl.Illinois.edu/projects/cwid